



AECOM
277 West Nationwide Boulevard
Columbus, OH 43215-2566
www.aecom.com

614 464 4500 tel
614 464 0588 fax

October 24, 2016

Mr. Franklin Christman
Village Administrator
Village of Ashville
200 East Station Street
Ashville, Ohio 43103

**RE: Bid Recommendations
Village of Ashville, Ohio WRRF Improvements 2016 (Part B)
60440011**

Dear Mr. Christman:

Bids were received for the above-referenced project and publicly opened on Thursday October 20, 2016, at 2:00 PM. A total of seven (7) bids were received. Listed below is information on these bids:

<u>Name</u>	<u>Base Bid Amount</u>
Fields Excavating, Inc.	\$1,489,605.15
Sam's Excavating Unlimited, Inc.	\$1,603,889.04
Darby Creek Excavating, Inc.	\$1,649,278.42
Tribute Contracting and Consultants LLC	\$1,788,306.40
Rock River Construction, LTD.	*\$1,853,729.00
Southern Ohio Trenching and Excavating Inc.	\$2,153,706.95
Shelly and Sands, Inc.	\$2,222,502.00

*corrected bid amount

The Engineer's estimate of cost of construction was \$1,686,230.00. The low bid did not exceed 10% of the Engineer's Estimate. The bids ranged from 11.7% below to 31.8% above the estimate.

The three (3) lowest bids were reviewed for conformance with the bidding requirements of the Contract Documents and comments are listed below:

Bid Form, Section 00 4113

- Each bidder submitted a completed bid form as required.

Acknowledgement of Addendum, Section 00 4113, Page 2

- Each bidder acknowledged receipt of Addenda 1, 2, and 3.



Bid Price Extensions, Section 00 4113, Page 10

- Each bidder's written numeric bid number matched their bid written in words.

Bid Security, Section 00 4313

- Each bidder submitted fully executed bonds on forms meeting the requirements of the Ohio Revised Code.
 - Fields Excavating, Inc.: The bidder listed The Fidelity and Deposit Company of Maryland as their bonding company.
 - Sam's Excavating Unlimited, Inc.: The bidder listed The Cincinnati Insurance Company as their bonding company.
 - Darby Creek Excavating, Inc.: The bidder listed The Fidelity and Deposit Company of Maryland as their bonding company.
- Each bidder's bonding company is listed in the Department of the Treasury Circular 570 as required.

Substitution Request Form, Section 00 4325

- None of the bidders listed any requested substitutions.

Proposed Subcontractors Form, Section 00 4336

- Each bidder submitted a properly completed Proposed Subcontractors Form as required.

Bidder's Qualifications, Section 00 4513

- Each bidder has submitted qualifications and references that imply and represent that they are responsible and viable organizations which are capable of completing the work. Reference checks were completed and based on the feedback obtained we have no reason to believe that the three lowest bidders are not qualified to successfully complete this project.

OEPA WPCLF Program Requirements, Section 00 4515

- EEO Certification: Each bidder submitted a properly completed certification form as required.
- Certification Regarding Debarment, Suspension, and Other Responsibility Matters: Each bidder submitted a properly completed certification form as required.
- DBE Forms 1A and 1B (note that these forms can be submitted after the bid):
 - Fields Excavating, Inc.: Forms 1A and 1B were completed and signed.
 - Sam's Excavating Unlimited, Inc.: Forms 1A and 1B were not completed or signed.
 - Darby Creek Excavating, Inc.: Forms 1A and 1B were completed and signed.
- American Iron & Steel Sign-off Form: Each bidder submitted a properly completed certification form as required.



Non-Collusion Affidavit, Section 00 4519

- Each bidder submitted a properly completed Non-Collision Affidavit Form as required.

Personal Property Tax Disclosure Affidavit, Section 00 4529

- Each bidder submitted a properly completed Personal Property Tax Disclosure Affidavit Form as required.

OPWC Governmental Requirements, Section 00 4550

- Fields Excavating, Inc. submitted a properly completed and signed the OPWC Governmental Requirement Forms as required.
- Sam's Excavating Unlimited, Inc. did not submit the OPWC Governmental Requirement Forms as required.
- Darby Creek Excavating, Inc. submitted a properly completed and signed the OPWC Governmental Requirement Forms as required.

Comments on Irregularities

In review of the bids, Sam's Excavating's failure to submit the OPWC Governmental Requirement Forms as required was the only noted irregularity. The Instruction to Bidders gives the Owner the right to waive any irregularities in the bids. Our understanding is that this relates to conditions that would not materially affect the price of the bid or give the bidder a critical advantage. Provided Sam's Excavating could submit the OPWC Governmental requirements, it is the opinion of AECOM that this irregularity would not materially affect the price of the bid or give the bidder a critical advantage.

Recommendation

It is the professional engineering opinion of AECOM that each of the three lowest bidders have sufficiently complied with the Project Manual requirements. As noted, the Owner has the right to waive irregularities as described in the Instructions to Bidders. There does not appear to be significant procedural, technical, or administrative restrictions in awarding the subject Contract.



Subject to review of your legal counsel and a determination that the Village has the funds available to cover the cost of the proposed work, we recommend that the Contract be awarded to:

Fields Excavating, Inc.
177 Twp Rd 191
Kitts Hill, Ohio 45645
In the amount of \$1,489,605.15

AECOM recommends that the Village have the bids reviewed by the appropriate legal counsel prior to the final Contract award to ensure that the legal and bonding requirements of the Bidding Documents are satisfied.

Sincerely,

AECOM Corporation

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Matt Noelker". The signature is written in a cursive, slightly slanted style.

Matthew Noelker, P.E.

Enclosures: Bid Tabulation

cc: Central Files
Brian Benedict – AECOM